# Determining Minimum Radius Length of Circle Horizontal Curves According to Pavement Damages 

Aidin Parsakhoo ${ }^{1}$ and Sattar Ezzati ${ }^{2} *$<br>${ }^{1}$ Assistant Professor, Department of Forestry, College of Forest Sciences, Gorgan University of Agricultural Sciences and Natural Resources, Gorgan, Iran<br>${ }^{2}$ Researcher, Département de Génie Mécanique, Université Laval, Québec, QC GIV 0A6, Canada

Received: 31 August 2016/ Accepted: 8 January 2017 / Published Online: 20 March 2017


#### Abstract

Finding a minimum allowable radius length of a circle horizontal curve is essential to reduce earthwork cost or damage to the forest ecosystem, as well as make driving more comfortable. The present study is conducted i) to analyze different radius lengths of circle horizontal curves using an integrated approach consists of a Civil3D in concert with the field surveys, and ii) to propose a set of geometric design criteria which are more consistent with the existing condition of forest road network in Hyrcanian forest, north of Iran. Depth of the rutting (i.e., machine footprint) and soil mechanical properties are examined for a total of 36 existing horizontal curves with different radius lengths. Further, technical characteristics (i.e., stopping sight distance, horizontal sight line offset and turning speed) and a few parameters on pavement damage are included and incorporated into the research objective. No-statistical differences between radius lengths of the horizontal curve for classes of 10-15 and $16-20 \mathrm{~m}$ may associate with dissimilarity in the soil mechanical properties and in the dimension of the rut depth. These findings confirmed that it is therefore possible to shorten allowable radius length of a circle horizontal curve to at least 12 m under a longitudinal slope of $5 \%$ for forest road network in the north of Iran.


Keywords: Civil3D, Horizontal curve, Hyrcanian forests, Road network, Soil mechanics

## 1 INTRODUCTION

Horizontal curves are the most important geometric parts of the forest roads network, which are essentially designed based on valley and ridge features to make driving comfortable. Non consideration of a minimum-curve radius entails additional cost and excessive damage to the forest ecosystem (Heninger et al., 2002; Stückelberger et al., 2007). The fact that minimizing damage is a basic role to road planners to keep the ecosystem, sustainable, and maintain road system serviceability, thus, it
is imperative to take advantageous of these benefits which could be achieved through better planning of the road system and well-adjusting of technical capabilities (e.g., road tangents or curves) that are aligned in spirit with the realistic conditions of the terrain. According to a few traditional forest road engineering textbooks (e.g., standards guide nos. 131 and 148) a minimum radius length of circle horizontal curve is suggested to 16 m for the secondary forest roads network in Iran (i.e., see Sarikhani and Majnonian 1999). Sometimes, one

[^0]may find curves that have been constructed with a length below this value. Admittedly, such a curve provides a low stopping sight distance for safe driving, although they might be reasonable if pavement quality and safety requirements taken into consideration (Purohit et al., 2011). Recently, this myopic focus has been increasingly criticized, because the omission of both terrain conditions and geometric design standards during planning practices (Ezzati et al., 2016). Improper design of the road component such as horizontal curves can lead to excessive damages to forest ecosystem, both of the ecological and of the engineering aspects. To do so, it is therefore, required to consider and analyze these capabilities either when the project will launch or where it needs to be implemented on the ground (Parsakhoo et al., 2010). It has been reported that curves with smaller length not only lead to increase costs of road maintenance and upgrading (Gendron et al., 2016), but also caused creases design and/or traffic speeds and safety requirements (Session et al., 2007).

Gravel is often brought to a road building location from either streams or quarries to protect the road surface, permit safe travels, increase transport productivity and minimize the adverse impact of road network to water quality and fish habit and wildlife habitat wildlife. A poor road surfaces including coarser gravel with organic matter, causes excessive damages to circle horizontal curves, especially, those of with smaller lengths (Miller et al., 1998; Liu et al., 2009). A useful criterion for determining the strength of subgrade material is California Bearing Ratio (CBR), which it indices of the thickness of the pavement material and swelling potential can be indexed (Kaakkurivaara et al., 2015).Subgrade compaction will depend on the types of material used and the control of surface moisture contents during compaction. Coarsegrained soil composition of finer clay particles provides a slippery condition, especially when moist content of a soil is increased and its liquid limit reached to critical levels. Plastic-clay
material exhibits shrink/swell behavior with moisture variability (Sharma et al., 2008; FaridGiglo et al., 2014), which may cause serious damages to pavement material (Azzam 2014). A rut usually defines as a wheel depression (i.e., depends on the amount of ground pressure) that formed over the road surface by trafficking vehicles, in when content of the soil moisture is in its high level. Ruts increase truck maintenance costs and decrease truck speed as well as reduce safety (Sessions 2007; Anderson et al., 2009). Wheels scuff the road surface, especially where vehicle brakes prior to reaching the curve. This certainly leads to deeper ruts and washboards on the road surface (Jaarsma and Willems 2002). Horizontal curves are the most important geometric parts of forest roads network, which are essentially designed based on valley and ridge features to make driving comfortable. Neglecting of minimum-curve radius entails additional costs and excessive damages to the forest ecosystem (Heninger et al., 2002; Stückelberger et al., 2007). Minimizing damage is a basic role to road managers to keep ecosystem sustainable and maintain roads system serviceable. Therefore, benefits could be achievable through efficient planning of road network and well-adjusting of technical capabilities (i.e., road tangents, curves, etc.) that are consistent with the realistic conditions of the terrain. According to a few traditional textbooks on forest road engineering (e.g., standards guide nos. 131 and 148), 16 m is a minimum radius length suggested for a circle horizontal curve for secondary forest roads network in Iran (Sarikhani and Majnonian, 1999). Sometimes, one may find curves that are primarily constructed with a length below this value. Admittedly, such a curve provides a low stopping sight distance for safe driving, although they might be satisfactory if pavement quality and safety requirements are taken into consideration (Purohit et al., 2011). This myopic focus has been increasingly criticized, because the omission of either terrain conditions or geometric design
$\qquad$
standards during planning practices (Ezzati et al., 2016). Improper design of the road access network, especially, horizontal curves can lead to excessive damages to forest ecosystem, both ecologically and engineering aspects. Therefore, appropriate measure should be considered before launching a project (Parsakhoo et al., 2010). It has been reported that curves with smaller length not only lead to increasing costs of road maintenance and upgrading (Gendron et al., 2016), but also cause decreases in design and/or traffic speeds and safety requirements (Sessions et al., 2007).
Gravel is often brought to a road building location from either streams or quarries to protect the road surfacing, safe passage, increase transport productivity, and minimize the adverse impact of roads network to water quality and wildlife habitat. Road surfacing with poor material, including coarser gravel with organic matter causes excessive damages to circle horizontal curves, especially those of with smaller lengths (Miller et al., 1998; Liu et al., 2009). Useful criteria for determining the strength of subgrade material is California Bearing Ratio (CBR), through which the thickness of the pavement material and swelling potential can be indexed (Kaakkurivaara et al., 2015). Subgrade compaction will depend on types of material used and the control of moisture during compaction. Coarse-grained soils compose of finer clay particles provide a slippery condition, especially when moist content is increased. Plastic-clay material exhibits shrink/swell behaviour with moisture variability (Sharma et al., 2008; Farid Giglo et al., 2014), which may cause serious damages to pavement material (Azzam, 2014). A rut usually defines a wheel depression formed over the road surface by trafficking vehicles, especially when moisture content of soil is high. Ruts reduce the speed and safety of the truck, but increase its maintenance costs (Sessions, 2007; Anderson et al., 2009). Wheels scuff the road surface especially where vehicle brakes prior to reach the curve. This certainly leads to deeper ruts
and washboards on the road surface (Jaarsma and Willems, 2002). AutoCAD Civil 3D is a civil engineering design and documentation solution enables road designers to provide feasible solutions and enhance project performances in concert with other regulations which certainly much faster than traditional methods. The present study aimed at (i) presenting an integrated system; includesCivil3D together with field checking to quickly analyze the geometric design of circle horizontal curves and propose a set of geometric design criteria which are more consistent with the existing condition of forest road network in Hyrcanian forest, northern Iran and (ii) developing the relationships between geometric design standards and independent variables (e.g., liquid limit, plastic limit, dry density and CBR) for existing circle horizontal curves. Additionally, the methodology attempts to do a comparative analysis for existing circle horizontal curves with a set of technical criteria (e.g., stopping sight distance, horizontal sight line offset, turning speed and pavement damages). The resulting findings would be utilized as a practical tool for determination of the minimum allowable radius length of a circle horizontal curve using a set of geometric design standards that are being consistent with the real conditions of the road network in the Hyrcanian region in north of Iran.

## 2 MATERIALS AND METHODS

### 2.1 Study area

The study was conducted in a forest area of approximately 2,324 ha, located in southeast of the Sari province (between $36^{\circ} 19^{\prime} 00^{\prime \prime} \mathrm{N}$ and $36^{\circ}$ $21^{\prime} 20^{\prime \prime}$ latitude and $53^{\circ} 10^{\prime} 50^{\prime \prime} \mathrm{E}$ and $53^{\circ}$ 1555 longitude), north of Iran. The forest is managed by the company of wood and paper industries in the Mazandaran region. Elevation of the area ranges from 300 to 970 masl. The forest is a mixed stands with Hrnbeam (Carpinus betulus L.) Oiental Beech (Fagus orientalis L.), and Ionwood (Parrotian persica C.A. Mey) being the dominant speciesthat managed under uneven-
aged regime. Geological features of the area include marly, limestones and lime conglomerates. Average annual precipitation is 723 mm with most falls in winter (sometimes in combination with snow) and the minimum is in June, with mean annual temperatures of $17^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. Approximately $10 \%$ of the area situated in a rough topography condition (above $30 \%$ ), while the rest has a gentle slope gradient (below 30\%).

### 2.2 Methodology

### 2.2.1 Field survey

A total of 36 horizontal curves are fully investigated in the area in polar methods using a manual compass and a taped meter. Dimension of ruts on the road surfaces across each curve is measured carefully. Stopping sight distance ( $S$ in meter) is affected by both turning speed ( $V$ in km $\mathrm{h}^{-1}$ ) and coefficient of friction $(F)$ between tire and road network as the case in practice (Parsakhoo 2013). To compute turning speed, we established how long it takes for each vehicle to travel a given distance for 10 times. Stopping sight distance calculated as in Parsakhoo (2013) based on Eq.1. The parameter of $M$ is the middle ordinate or the horizontal sight line offset whose defines as a distance between road inside edge and sight line, it calculated as Eq.2. Curve length is also
determined as Eq.3. Eventually, the distance of beginning and end of curve from point of intersection is calculated as Eq4.
$S=V+\frac{0.13 V^{2}}{30 F}$
$M=r\left(1-\cos \frac{\beta}{2}\right)-\left(\frac{W}{2}+1.5\right)$
$L=\frac{\beta \pi r}{180}$
$t=r \tan \frac{\beta}{2}$
where $r$ is the radius length of a curve ( m ), $W$ is the average width of travel way ( m ), $\beta$ is the central angle of the curve (degree), $L$ is the length of $\operatorname{arc}(\mathrm{m}), t$ is the distances from an intersection point $(I P)$ to a beginning $(B C)$ and an end $(E C)$ of a curve $(\mathrm{m})$, and 1.5 is the length of shoulder and ditch (m) (Figure 1). The curves platting are carried out in Civil3D software, and statistical analyses are conducted into SPSS software version 14.


Figure 1 Geometry of a circular horizontal curve
$\qquad$

### 2.2.2 Atterberg limits

Liquid Limit (LL) of soil sample determined as Eq. 5 (Atterberg 1911):
$L L=W n_{N} \times\left[\frac{N}{25}\right]^{0.121}$
where $N$ is the number of drops of the cup required to close the groove, $W n$ is the soil moisture content (\%) in which groove is closed. The soil moisture content is measured at which soil changes from liquid state to plastic state (i.e., at which two sides of a groove come close together for a distance of 12.7 mm under the impact of 25 numbers of blows. The plasticity index (PI) of a soil is the range of water content over. It defines as the numerical difference between the liquid limit and plastic limit (Atterberg 1911) that
$P I=L L-P L$

### 2.2.3 California Bearing Ratio (CBR)

The CBR value of a soil is associated with the strength of a soil (Yetimoglu et al., 2005) that calculated as Eq. 7.
$Y_{d}=\frac{Y_{t}}{1+W n}$
where $Y_{d}$ equivalents to dry unit weight of the soil $\left(\mathrm{g} \mathrm{cm}^{-3}\right), Y_{t}$ is the total unit weight $\left(\mathrm{g} \mathrm{cm}^{-3}\right)$ and $W n$ is the soil moisture content (\%).

### 2.2.4 Computer design

Horizontal and vertical alignments are generated in the Civil3D environment by plotting the location of both tangent lengths and points of intersection for a road alignment. Through the process, a circle horizontal curve is used to provide a transition between two tangents and generally can be designed either
automatically or manually. To address high speed travelled, a spiral transition and a super elevation further adjusted to each curve. Numeric parameters therefore tuned for each alignment curve and spiral transitions same as with those are already recommended (e.g., see alignment entity tables in Sarikhani and Majnonian 1999). The program is much friendly, it enables a user to insert or quickly modify parameters before or after platting a circle horizontal curve (Lugo and Gucinski 2000).

Collected information is statistically analyzed using a general linear model (GLM) procedure in SAS platform. Student-NewmanKeuls multiple comparison tests is utilized to compare mean values at the $5 \%$ level; numerical diagrams were also generated in an Excel package under Microsoft license.

## 3 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

It is possible to reduce the overall cost of operations through efficient planning of road network and design of circle horizontal curves (Stückelberger et al., 2007; Ghajar et al. 2013). However, safety requirements must be taken into consideration to possibly reduce both economic and environmental costs. In this study, the radius length of a curve is classified into five categories i.e., $10-15 \mathrm{~m}$ (A), $16-20 \mathrm{~m}$ (B), $21-50 \mathrm{~m}$ (C), $51-100 \mathrm{~m}$ (D), and 101-200 m (E). Every curve analyzed from technical geometric criteria as they are listed in Table 1. The results indicated that almost $86 \%$ of the curves had radius lengths of above 15 m .

The ANOVA test indicated that turning speed significantly influenced stopping sight distances, rut area and depth of rutting for all studied curves (Table 2).
$\qquad$

Table 1 Technical geometric criteria of study circle horizontal curves. $t=$ tangent length; $w=$ average width of travel way; $\beta=$ central angle of curve; $L=$ length of arc; $V=$ turning speed; $S=$ stopping sight distance; $M=$ middle ordinate or horizontal sight line offset

| Radius <br> class | Radius length of a curve (m) | Geometric criteria |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | $\begin{gathered} t \\ (\mathbf{m}) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} W \\ (\mathbf{m}) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \boldsymbol{\beta} \\ \text { (degree) } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} L \\ (\mathbf{m}) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} V \\ \left(k m h^{-1}\right) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} S \\ (\mathbf{m}) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} M \\ (\mathbf{m}) \end{gathered}$ | Rut <br> depth <br> (cm) | Rut dimension $\left(\mathrm{m}^{2} 100 \mathrm{~m}^{-2}\right)$ |
| B | 20.00 | 23.00 | 10.30 | 98.10 | 34.00 | 25.00 | 31.80 | 4.80 | 4.80 | 2.00 |
| C | 33.00 | 14.00 | 5.50 | 46.80 | 27.00 | 30.00 | 39.80 | 0.00 | 4.30 | 1.60 |
| D | 83.00 | 16.50 | 5.50 | 22.50 | 32.50 | 40.00 | 57.30 | 0.00 | 3.40 | 1.60 |
| C | 28.50 | 12.30 | 5.50 | 46.80 | 23.00 | 30.00 | 39.80 | 0.00 | 4.90 | 1.80 |
| C | 29.00 | 12.00 | 5.50 | 44.10 | 22.00 | 30.00 | 39.80 | 0.00 | 4.70 | 1.70 |
| D | 91.00 | 21.00 | 5.50 | 26.10 | 41.50 | 40.00 | 57.30 | 0.00 | 3.40 | 0.80 |
| D | 70.00 | 20.00 | 5.50 | 31.50 | 39.00 | 40.00 | 57.30 | 0.00 | 3.60 | 1.50 |
| B | 15.00 | 15.00 | 6.60 | 90.90 | 24.00 | 20.00 | 24.30 | 1.10 | 7.00 | 2.60 |
| C | 40.00 | 16.00 | 5.50 | 44.10 | 31.00 | 35.00 | 48.30 | 0.00 | 4.00 | 1.40 |
| C | 28.50 | 12.00 | 5.50 | 45.90 | 23.00 | 30.00 | 39.80 | 0.00 | 5.00 | 1.60 |
| D | 72.50 | 23.00 | 5.90 | 35.10 | 44.50 | 40.00 | 57.30 | 0.40 | 3.60 | 1.10 |
| C | 32.00 | 16.00 | 5.80 | 53.10 | 30.00 | 30.00 | 39.80 | 0.30 | 5.10 | 1.60 |
| C | 28.50 | 10.00 | 5.50 | 39.60 | 20.00 | 30.00 | 39.80 | 0.00 | 5.20 | 1.70 |
| D | 52.00 | 12.90 | 5.50 | 27.90 | 25.00 | 35.00 | 48.30 | 0.00 | 4.30 | 1.30 |
| C | 35.50 | 10.00 | 5.50 | 30.60 | 19.00 | 30.00 | 39.80 | 0.00 | 4.60 | 1.40 |
| B | 17.00 | 13.00 | 5.80 | 74.70 | 22.00 | 20.00 | 24.30 | 0.30 | 5.20 | 2.50 |
| B | 15.00 | 12.00 | 5.50 | 76.50 | 20.00 | 20.0 | 24.30 | 0.00 | 7.10 | 2.80 |
| C | 42.00 | 13.00 | 5.50 | 35.10 | 26.00 | 35.0 | 48.30 | 0.00 | 4.40 | 1.90 |
| D | 84.00 | 23.00 | 5.60 | 30.60 | 45.00 | 40.0 | 57.30 | 0.10 | 3.50 | 1.40 |
| C | 45.00 | 13.00 | 5.50 | 32.40 | 25.00 | 35.0 | 48.30 | 0.00 | 3.70 | 1.70 |
| C | 27.00 | 14.00 | 5.50 | 54.00 | 25.00 | 30.0 | 39.80 | 0.00 | 5.50 | 1.90 |
| E | 161.00 | 19.00 | 5.50 | 13.50 | 38.00 | 40.0 | 57.30 | 0.00 | 2.50 | 0.80 |
| C | 30.00 | 10.00 | 5.50 | 37.80 | 20.00 | 30.0 | 39.80 | 0.00 | 5.20 | 2.00 |
| C | 44.00 | 14.00 | 5.50 | 36.00 | 28.00 | 35.0 | 48.30 | 0.00 | 4.70 | 2.00 |
| B | 20.00 | 12.00 | 5.50 | 60.30 | 21.00 | 25.0 | 31.80 | 0.00 | 6.10 | 2.00 |
| B | 17.50 | 14.00 | 6.10 | 78.30 | 23.00 | 20.0 | 24.30 | 0.60 | 5.30 | 2.40 |
| B | 20.00 | 22.00 | 8.90 | 95.40 | 33.00 | 25.0 | 31.80 | 3.40 | 5.60 | 2.00 |
| D | 86.00 | 13.00 | 5.50 | 17.10 | 26.00 | 40.0 | 57.30 | 0.00 | 3.30 | 1.90 |
| B | 17.00 | 13.00 | 6.00 | 76.50 | 23.00 | 20.0 | 24.30 | 0.50 | 5.10 | 2.30 |
| E | 110.00 | 14.00 | 5.50 | 15.30 | 28.00 | 40.0 | 57.30 | 0.00 | 2.40 | 1.20 |
| B | 15.00 | 18.00 | 7.80 | 101.70 | 27.00 | 20.0 | 24.30 | 2.30 | 7.20 | 2.70 |
| E | 185.00 | 17.00 | 5.50 | 10.80 | 35.00 | 40.0 | 57.30 | 0.00 | 2.20 | 0.90 |
| C | 29.00 | 10.00 | 5.50 | 39.60 | 20.00 | 30.0 | 39.80 | 0.00 | 4.10 | 2.10 |
| D | 57.40 | 23.00 | 6.30 | 44.10 | 44.00 | 35.0 | 48.30 | 0.80 | 3.60 | 1.40 |
| A | 13.00 | 13.50 | 6.30 | 92.00 | 20.90 | 20.0 | 24.30 | 0.80 | 5.90 | 2.50 |
| A | 12.00 | 11.60 | 5.60 | 88.00 | 18.40 | 20.0 | 24.30 | 0.10 | 5.40 | 2.20 |
| Average | 48.10 | 14.90 | 5.93 | 48.40 | 27.70 | 30.80 | 41.70 | 0.30 | 4.60 | 1.70 |

$\qquad$

A stopping sight distance might be restricted by overgrowing trees on the right of way and exposing the steep cut slope, so it highly recommended frequently grabbing invasive tree or clearing brush on the right of way at least twice every year and laying back the ridge slope failure to improve sight distance and make driving more comfortable (Sessions 2007; Nguyen et al., 2008).

A turning speed of $40 \mathrm{~km} \mathrm{~h}^{-1}$ would thus suggest lengths of the tangent should not be too long (Crossley et al., 2001). Interestingly, there are statistical differences among curves with different radius lengths in terms of the horizontal sight line offset $(P=0.0086)$. Despite
no variability of turning speed among curves with different radius lengths of $10-15 \mathrm{~m}$ (A) and $16-20 \mathrm{~m}(B)$, turning speed is increased significantly for the curves with higher lengths (i.e., above 21 m ; see Figure 2).

Akay et al. (2008) reported that depth of rutting is affected by geometric design factors include the radius length of the curve, turning speed and dynamic weight of the vehicle. The stopping sight distance is calculated 25 m in radius classes of A and B , which is significantly lower than those values observed for other classes (see Figure3).

Table 2 The ANOVA of the different variables of turning speed and pavement damage for circle horizontal curves. $V=$ turning speed, $S=$ stopping sight distance, $M=$ horizontal sight line offset

| Source of variance | $\boldsymbol{d} \boldsymbol{f}$ | Sum of square | Mean square | $\boldsymbol{F}$ values | $\boldsymbol{P}$ values |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $V\left(\mathrm{~km} \mathrm{~h}^{-1}\right)$ | 4 | $1,748.71$ | 437.17 | 85.27 | $<0.0001$ |
| $S(\mathrm{~m})$ | 4 | $4,761.64$ | $1,190.41$ | 83.79 | $<0.0001$ |
| $M(\mathrm{~m})$ | 4 | 12.72 | 3.18 | 4.12 | 0.0086 |
| Rut depth $(\mathrm{cm})$ | 4 | 41.44 | 10.36 | 27.86 | $<0.0001$ |
| Rut dimension $\left(\mathrm{m}^{2} \mathrm{ar}\right)$ | 4 | 7.06 | 1.76 | 23.99 | $<0.0001$ |



Figure 2 Effect of turning speed on different radius lengths of curve


Figure 3 Effect of stopping sight distance on different curve radius classes


Figure 4 Effect of horizontal sightline offset on different radius lengths of curve

It can be concluded that the $M$ might be a useful parameter for determining amount of required earthwork on the crest of the curve to provide visibility of the area. Our findings confirmed that a higher value of $M$ (i.e., a horizontal sight line offset) observed in which a curve has a small radius length (i.e., below 20 m; Figure 4).

Anderson et al. (2009) indicated that rut width, rut index and depth of rutting increased with decreasing radius length. In our case study, the rut index calculated through combining rut
depth and width of rutting. Rut depth decreased with increasing length of the radius. The greatest rut depth of 6 and 7 cm are measured on curves with smaller lengths of $10-15 \mathrm{~m}$ (A) and $16-20 \mathrm{~m}(B)$, respectively (Figure 5). It anticipate a deeper rut (i.e., more than 15 cm in depth) will result in serious damages to base layer and subgrade layer of a road, so where depth of rut is increased from 5 cm to 12 cm , reshaping and smoothing requirements would immediately require on the surface of road.
$\qquad$

Neglecting such maintenance requirements incur uncomfortable driving, loosen surface material quickly and further increase the cost of the maintenance and upgrading (Way et al., 2005; Sessions et al. 2007).

The results well consistent with Talebi et al. (2015) who reported a higher depth of rut is seen on the road surface, particularly where the radius length of a curve is too small. Figure 6 shows that the rut area is measured significantly greater for the radius classes of A and B in contrast with later
classes, albeit, the differences are not statistically significant in contrast with earlier classes. Indeed, either area or the number of rutting increased with decreasing radius length. Increase number of ruts might be directly associated with bed laxity or low resistant surfacing (Talebi et al., 2015), which imposed by exerting load on the ground that exceed road pavement capacity.


Figure 5 Effect of rut depth on different radius lengths of curve


Figure 6 Effect of rut area on pavement of on different radius lengths of curve

In the current study, pavement materials are composed of $46 \%$ gravel, $32 \%$ sand and $22 \%$ silt and clay. Figure 7 confirms that the liquid limit and plastic index are decreased to $4 \%$ and $3 \%$, respectively, by decreasing radius length. In general, soils with higher of plasticity limit and of liquid limit are not suitable, because of bearing compressibility and water permeability, which allow surface flow to penetrate into the sub-base and destroy the road body as quickly as possible (Ryan et al., 2004). A higher pressure (e.g., both horizontal and vertical) and shear stress exerted by the vehicle wheels would be expected, especially, in which the curve has a small radius length (Kozlowski, 2000; Ezzati et al., 2012; Solgi et al., 2016). Machine
induces soil compaction owing to the exerted normal pressure and vibration, which it may imply reduction of the content of soil moisture (Ampoorter et al., 2007; Ezzati et al., 2012) and, therefore, instantaneous reduction of the liquid limit and plastic limit. In addition, increases in traffic intensity can directly affect soil bearing capacity and loose of pavement material (Miller et al., 1998). The CBR values decreased from $89 \%$ (i.e., radius class A; 10-15 m) to $71 \%$ (i.e., radius class E ; $101-200 \mathrm{~m}$ ) with increasing radius length (Figure 8). Evidence of the linear relationship between CBR and soil density or soil moisture content is also found by Crossley et al. (2001), for a variety of soils.


Figure 7 Atterberg test limits, including plastic index and liquid limit for different radius lengths of curve
$\qquad$


Figure 8 Variations of California bearing ratio (CBR) test by increasing length of the radius of curve

## 4 CONCLUSIONS

Determining a minimum allowable radius length of a horizontal curve is important as an effective geometric design factor for forest road network under a particular set of conditions. Nonsignificant differences between curves with small radius length of $10-15 \mathrm{~m}$ and $16-20 \mathrm{~m}$ are strongly related to the level of soil mechanical properties and depth of rutting, which confirmed the fact that it would be possible to consider a smaller radius length for circle horizontal curve on secondary forest road network. Very few of the ruts are observed where either the radius length of a curve is larger or a road surface is more stable (i.e., high CBR).

It is assumed that choosing an appropriate road gradient and a feasible radius length of circle horizontal curves is imperative, it might lead to minimize road maintenance and upgrading cost, in particular, where the slope gradient is less than $5 \%$ and minimum radius length of a curve is set to above 12 m , but that is left to be seen and requires more field research. In the current case study, turning speed decreased to $21 \mathrm{~km} \mathrm{~h}^{-1}$. Future work with AutoCAD civil3D involves the development of better vision of a road segment need to be
included into the objective, especially for in which a realistic, large-scale plan is of concern.

## 5 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The research is supported by Gorgan University of agricultural sciences and natural resources. We would like to acknowledge experts and local harvesting teams for their kindly assistances in logistics and data collection.

## 6 REFERENCES

Akay, A.E., Erdas, O., Mahmut, R. and Yuksel, A. Estimating sediment yield from a forest road network by using a sediment prediction model and GIS techniques. J. Build. Environ., 2008; 43: 687-695.

Ampoorter, E, Goris, R., Cornelis, W. and Verheyen, K. Impact of mechanized logging on compaction status of sandy forest soils. Ecol. Manage., 2007; 241(1): 162-74.

Anderson, A., Howard, H., Ayers, P. and Liu, K . Influence of turning radius on wheeled military vehicle induced rut formation. J. Terra. Mech., 2009; 46: 49-55.

Atterberg, A. On the investigation of the physical properties of soils and on the
plasticity of clays. Int. Mitt. Bod., 1911; 1: 10-43. (In German).

Azzam, W.R. Behaviour of modified clay microstructure using polymer nanocomposites technique. J. Alex. Eng., 2014; 53(1): 143-150.

Crossley, C.P., Kibiwot, V.N., Reynolds, A.J. and Rickson, R.J.W. Soil and water: rut formation and rolling resistance on earth roads. J. Agri. Eng. Res., 2001; 78(1): 99107.

Ezzati, S., Akbar, N., Rab, M.A. and Zenner, E.K., Recovery of soil bulk density, porosity and rutting from ground skidding over a $20-$ year period after timber harvesting in Iran. Silva Fennica. 2012; 46(4): 521-538.

Ezzati, S., Najafi, A. and Bettinger, P. Finding feasible harvest zones in mountainous areas using integrated spatial multi-criteria decision analysis. Land Use Policy. 2016; 59: 478-491.

FaridGiglo, B., Arami, A. and Akhzari, D. Assessing the role of some soil properties on aggregate stabilityusing path analysis (case study: silty-clay- loam and clay-loam soil from gully lands in northwest of Iran). J. ECOPERSIA. 2014; 2(2): 513-523.

Gendron, B., Pulkki, R. Posta, M. and Favreau, J. Overview of wood transportation and. forest value chain optimization and sustainability. 2016; 312-330.

Ghajar, I., Najafi, A. Karimimajd, A.M. Boston, K. and Torabi, S.A. A program for cost estimation of forest road construction using engineer's method. For. Sci. Tech. 2013; 9(3): 111-117.

Heninger R, Scott W, Dobkowski A, Miller R, Anderson H, Duke S. Soil disturbance and 10 -year growth response of coast Douglas-
fir on non-tilled skid trails in the Oregon Cascades. Can. J. Res., 2002; 32: 233-246.

Jaarsma, C.F. and Willems, P.A. Reducing habitat fragmentation by minor rural roads through traffic calming. Landscape Urban Plan. 2002; 58: 125-135.

Kaakkurivaara, T., Vuorimies, N., Kolisoja, P. and Uusitalo, J. Applicability of portable tools in assessing the bearing capacity of forest roads. Silva Fennica. 2015; 49(2): 126.

Kozlowski, T.T. Responses of woody plants to human-induced environmental stresses: issues, problems, and strategies for alleviating stress. Crit. Rev. Plant. Sci., 2000; 19: 91-170.

Liu, J., Shi, B., Jiang, H., Bae, S. and Huang, H. Improvement of water stability of clay aggregates admixed with aqueous polymer soil stabilizers. Catena. 2009; 77: 175-179.

Liu, K., Ayers, P., Howard, H., Jones, R. and Anderson, A. Prediction of rut depth during military vehicle turning manoeuvres using a modified sinkage numeric. J. Transp., 2010; 53: 1019-1024.

Lugo, A.E. and Gucinski, H. Function, effects and management of forest roads. For Ecol. Manage., 2000; 133: 249-262.

Miller, W.P., Willis, R.L. and Levy, G.J. Aggregate stabilization in kaolinitic soils by low rates of anionic polyacrylamide. J. Soil Use Manage., 1998; 14(2): 1001-105.

Najafi, A., Sobhani, H., Saeed, A., Makhdom, M. and Mohajer, M.M. Planning and assessment of alternative forest road and skidding networks. Croat J. Engin., 2008; 29(1): 63-73.

Nguyen, V.N, Matsuo, T., Inaba, S. and Koumoto T. Experimental analysis of vertical soil reaction and soil stress
$\qquad$
distribution under off-road tires. J. Terra. Mech., 2008; 45: 25-44.

Park, Y., Park, C. and Chon, K. Development of potential measures to evaluate the safety of curves in rural highways. J. Civil. Eng., 2003; 7: 58-70.

Parsakhoo, A. Forest road designing. ISBN: 978-964-151-779-5, Noruzi Press. 2013; 159 P.

Parsakhoo, A., Lotfalian, M. and Hosseini, S.A. Forest roads planning and construction in Iranian forestry. J. Civil. Engin. Const. Tech., 2010; 1(1): 14-18.

Purohit, S.B., Lapalikar, S.R. and Jain, V. Effect of road profile and curves generated by wheel on the performance of a shock absorber of a motorcycle. J. Sci. Tech., 2011; 4: 534-538.

Ryan, T., Phillips, H., Ramsay, J. and Dempsey J. Forest Road Manual: Guidelines for the design, construction and management of forest roads: National Council for Forest Research and Development. COFORD, Dublin. 2004; 170 P.

Sarikhani, N. and Majnonian, B. Guideline for production of forest roads project. J. Plan. Bud. Org. Pub., 1999; 148: 178-192.

Sessions, J. Forest road operations in the Tropics. ISBN-10 3-540-46392-5 Springer-

Verlag Berlin Heidelberg New York. 2007; 170 P.

Sharma, R.S., PhaniKumar, B.R. and Rao, B.V. Engineering behaviour of a remoulded expansive clay blended with lime, calcium chloride and rice-husk ash. J. Mat. Civil. Eng., 2008; 20(8): 509-515.

Solgi, A., Najafi, A., Ezzati, S. and Ferencik, M. Assessment of ground-based skidding impacts on the horizontally rate and extent of soil disturbance along the margin of the skid trail. Ann. Scie., 2016; 73(2): 513-522.

Stückelberger, J., Heinimann, H.R. and Chung, W. Improved road network design models with the consideration of various link patterns and road design elements. Can. J. Res., 2007; 37: 2281-2298.

Talebi, M., Majnounian, B., Abdi, E. and Tehrani, F.B. Developing a GIS database for forest road management in Arasbaran forest. J. Sci. Tech., 2015; 11: 27-35. (In Persian).

Way, T.R. Erbach, D.C. and Johnson, C.E. Soil displacement beneath an agricultural tractor drive tire. J. Terra. Mech., 2005; 42: 35-46.

Yetimoglu, T., Inanir. M. and Inanir, O. A study on bearing capacity of randomly distributed fiber-reinforced sand fills overlying soft clay. J. Geo., 2005; 23: 174183.

## تعيين حداقل شعاع قوس بر اساس ميزان خسارات به بستر روسازى در شبكه جادههاى جنگَلى

آيدين پارساخو' و ستار عزتى 「*

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { ا - استاديار، دانشكده علوم جنگً، گروه جنگًدارى، دانشگاه علوم كشاورزى و منابع طبيعى گر گان، گرگًان، ايران } \\
& \text { Y- ثرَوهشگَ، دانشكده مهندسى مكانيك، گروه مهندسى صنايع، دانشگاه لاوال، كوبَى، كانادا }
\end{aligned}
$$

چحكيده حداقل شعاع مجاز قوسهاى افقى براى شبكه جادههاى جنگلى ضرورى بوده، كه منجر به كاهش هزينه عمليات خاكى و خسارات به اكوسيستم جنگل شده و عبور ايمنى را فراهم مىسازد. مطالعه حاضر به ارزيابى قوسهاى افقى با طول شعاع متغير و پيشنهاد معيارهاى فنى مطابق با شرايط جنگکلهاى خزرى در شمال ايران، با استفاده از يك رويكرد تر كيبى؛ استفاده از روش كامپيوترى Civil3D به همراه بازديد ميدانى پرداخته است. ابعاد شيار (جاى چرخ ماشين) و خصوصيات مكانيكى بستر جادهسازى براى צץ قوس افقى با شعاعهاى متفاوت اندازهگيرى شد. همچنیين، خصوصيات فنى (فاصله ديد توقف، فاصله اطمينان ديد و سرعت قوس) و خسارات وارده به بستر روسازى جاده، نيز اندازهگيرى و ثبت شد. تجزيه و تحليل دادهها نشان داد كه ارتباط معنىدار ضعيفى بين خصوصيات مكانيكى و اندازه شيار با قوسهاى
 مىتواند كمتر از استانداردهاى فعلى باشد. بنابراين، تحقيق حاضر نشان داد كه شيب طولى مجاز ه د درصد و شعاع قوس افقى 1 I متر در جنگلههاى شمال ايران مناسب و امكانپذير مىباشد.

كلمات كليدى: Civil3D، جنگل هاى هير كانى، شبكه جادههاى جنگلى، قوس افقى، مكانيكى خاى


[^0]:    *Corresponding author: Researcher, Département de Génie Mécanique, Université Laval, Québec, QC G1V 0A6, Canada, Tel: +98 918379 0470, E-mail: sattar.ezzati.1@ulaval.ca

